

MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL MEETING OF THE HONORABLE MAYOR AND CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF CHANDLER, ARIZONA, held at the Council Conference Room, 88 E. Chicago St., on Thursday, December 9, 2010, at 5:32 p.m.

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY MAYOR BOYD W. DUNN.

The following members answered roll call:

Boyd W. Dunn	Mayor
Bob Caccamo	Vice-Mayor
Trinity Donovan	Councilmember
Rick Heumann	Councilmember
Matt Orlando	Councilmember
Jack Sellers	Councilmember
Jeff Weninger	Councilmember

Also in attendance:

Jay Tibshraeny	Mayor-Elect
Kevin Hartke	Councilmember-Elect

Rich Dlugas	Acting City Manager
Pat McDermott	Assistant City Manager
Mary Wade	City Attorney
Marla Paddock	City Clerk

CONSENT:

1. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE DIRECTION ON PROPOSALS FOR CITY MANAGER RECRUITMENT

MAYOR DUNN stated the Council would need to move forward and begin a process. He asked the Council for ideas on what should be done.

VICE-MAYOR CACCAMO noted the firms were similar and believed the only way they could be differentiated would be by determining which firm would offer the best guarantee.

COUNCILMEMBER HEUMANN questioned what the scope of work was. He questioned whether a full blown search was needed. He stated that one of the consultants, Dick Bowers, offered a different approach than the other firms.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY stated as he had evaluated the different proposals and believed the Council would have to decide what services they did not want, which would make the search not be full blown. He stated that they should pick a firm and look at the services that they offer and decide which services are needed. He believed staff should be given direction so that they could negotiate with the firm, with them then starting their assessment phase and have them interview the Council.

MAYOR DUNN asked if there were any City Manager positions being recruited locally. He assumed that none of the firms were currently conducting searches locally.

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO asked which firms had conducted City Manager

recruitments for the cities of Scottsdale, Tempe and Mesa.

Human Resources Director DEBBIE STAPLETON stated she was not aware of the firms that conducted those recruitments but clarified that she could find out. She stated those firms that conducted ones for City Manager would have included them in their proposals. She believed one of the firms had recently done the recruitment for the City Manager position for the City of Flagstaff.

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO noted that one of the firms, CPS, had handled the last two City Manager recruitments for the City of Chandler.

MS. STAPLETON stated that they had handled the City Manager recruitment done in 2003.

COUNCILMEMBER DONOVAN noted that many of the firms highlighted recruitments that they had done. She asked to go down the list of firms highlighting what they had done for the City of Chandler.

MS. STAPLETON highlighted the different recruitments done by the various firms:

- Waters-Oldani Executive Recruitment conducted the Assistant City Manager and the Human Resources Manager recruitments in 1999, the recruitment of the CAPA Director in 2000, the recruitment of the Chief Information Officer in 2002 and the recruitment of the Police Chief in 2003.
- CPS Human Resource Services handled the Transportation Engineer recruitment in 2000, City Manager recruitment in 2003, Assistant Planning and Development Director in 2006, and the Budget Manager/Management Services Director recruitment in 2006 and 2007.
- Slavin Management Consultants conducted the Assistant City Manager recruitment in 2002
- Collin Baenziger & Associates conducted the Public Works Director recruitment in 2006.

Ms. Stapleton noted that each consultant was to highlight their experience in City Manager recruitments, but noted that each consultant was open to any service.

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO asked why input had not been received from firms that conducted City Manager recruitments in Tempe, Scottsdale, and Mesa.

MS. STAPLETON stated she had contacted firms that had been frequently used. She stated she contacted the firm Mercer, but did not get a response from them. She told the Council that she did not contact Bob Murray & Associates due to not having a good experience with them in the past. She believed that Bob Murray & Associates may have conducted one of the searches in Tempe, Scottsdale or Mesa.

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO asked who they had hired. MS. STAPLETON stated that they had hired the Public Works Director in 2006.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY believed that Baenziger had a weak presence in the west coast. He noted that most of their recruitments were done on the east coast.

COUNCILMEMBER SELLERS stated he was impressed with the proposal that was done by Baenziger. He stated he had been involved with the Public Works Director recruitment and was impressed with Baenziger as they handled that recruitment.

COUNCILMEMBERS ORLANDO and HEUMANN expressed their satisfaction with the warranty that was provided by Baenziger.

COUNCILMEMBER SELLERS stated he was impressed with Baenziger's process and believed it was more personalized.

Assistant City Manager PAT MCDERMOTT explained that Baenziger had been trying to obtain a west coast presence. He stated that the individual who handled the Public Works Director recruitment was no longer with the company and plans to have a Western Office never materialized.

COUNCILMEMBER WENINGER read the proposal of the firm which stated that it recruited nationally but specified in specialty regions. He believed Baenziger was not as experienced in other regions.

COUNCILMEMBER HEUMANN believed that the City Manager job was a prime job in the Country and would receive many applicants from across the country.

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO stated he liked the flat rate cost that was provided by Baenziger compared to that of the other firms. He stated there were no hidden costs with Baenziger. He was open to any firm but believed there would need to be a flat rate or a not to exceed dollar amount with other firms. He added that a flat rate could be negotiated with the other firms.

COUNCILMEMBER SELLERS asked if travel expenses would be paid by the City.

MS. STAPLETON concurred.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY believed that the Council should choose a firm and then give staff direction to negotiate a contract. He stated the contract would have to be revisited if staff could not negotiate it with what Council likes. He stated there may be things in each proposal that the Council likes or dislikes but believed those items could be negotiated.

COUNCILMEMBER SELLERS stated that after he read the proposal given by Dick Bowers, he believed the cost was too expensive. He believed he would only serve as a consultant to staff, with staff doing all of the work.

COUNCILMEMBER DONOVAN stated she did not believe that Mr. Bowers had enough interest in that realm.

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO noted that staff had been directed to get proposals that ranged from limited to full-blown searches. He assumed that his search would be limited.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY believed that Mr. Bowers was a small shop who would do the work himself but would utilize City staff.

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO asked what recruitments had been done for Chandler by Ralph Anderson and Associates.

Acting City Manager RICH DLUGAS stated that Ralph Anderson and Associates had conducted the recruitment for the Fire Chief.

COUNCILMEMBER HEUMANN noted Ralph Anderson and Associates had a lot of experience in recruitments in California.

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO noted that the firm had a lot of experience recruiting City Managers.

COUNCILMEMBER-ELECT HARTKE stated he was least impressed with Ralph Anderson's proposal.

COUNCILMEMBER HEUMANN stated that one of the things he liked better about Baenziger was that their schedule was better detailed out.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY questioned what guarantee they would offer.

COUNCILMEMBER HEUMANN stated that the employee that was hired would be fully warrantied for the first year, with the City not paying anything. The City would pay expenses for the second year. He stated that in regards to some of the other firms, the City would pay for their expenses but would not have to pay their service fees again.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY stated that that could be negotiable and that it was a good point to have in the contract. He suggested the Council should pick their top 3 firms.

MAYOR DUNN stated he had not heard a consensus yet and did not think that would be beneficial.

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO asked what the Council what thoughts they had about Voorhees and Associates.

COUNCILMEMBER-ELECT HARTKE noted that the Vice-President of the company's Southwest Region was a member of the Planning and Zoning Commission.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY asked the City Attorney whether there could be a conflict of interest if a Planning and Zoning Commissioner headed the City Manager search. MS. WADE stated that there could be a conflict.

COUNCILMEMBER HEUMANN stated that there was not a lot of experience. He stated that the company had specialized in more current recruitments.

COUNCILMEMBER-ELECT HARTKE stated he was impressed with the recruitments the firm had done for cities in Texas due to their population size, but noted that the recruitments were not City Manager recruitments.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY noted that CPS Human Resource Services had conducted searches in California, Mesa, Paradise Valley and Pinal County. He told the Council that Pete Rios, Board Chair had been listed as the company's reference for the Pinal County recruitment. He stated he had spoken to Mr. Rios who told him the experience with the company went well. He stated Mr. Rios had high praise for Mr. Satow who headed the search for Pinal County's Manager.

Each of the members of the Council as well as Mayor-Elect Tibshraeny and Councilmember-Elect Hartke voiced their top 3 choices amongst the firms. The Council concurred with exploring CPS and Baenziger & Associates as their top two firms.

VICE-MAYOR CACCAMO asked if the City could specify which consultant from the firm was sent to work with the City.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY hoped the firm would have their lead working on the recruitment.

MS. STAPLETON clarified that that information should have been included in the firms' proposal.

COUNCILMEMBER HEUMANN believed that the fact that CPS was on the West Coast was a plus in regards to travel time and expenses. He stated he did believe the proposal from Baenziger was better.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY asked who had been the lead that handled the recruitment for the Public Works Director. MR. MCDERMOTT stated that the gentleman who had been the lead for the recruitment was no longer with the firm.

COUNCILMEMBER SELLERS noted that the firm had handled searches for the Attorney General's office. He further noted that the Baenziger firm stated in their proposal that two thirds of the Managers they had placed since 2000 were still working for the city that they were placed in.

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO reiterated that he liked the warranty that the firm offered.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY stated that the firm listed the resumes of their staff but did not indicate who would serve as the lead for the recruitment.

COUNCILMEMBER HEUMANN noted that on page 19 of the proposal provided by Baenziger indicated that Mr. Colin would serve as the Project Manager for the recruitment while Mr. Tom Freijo would serve as the Associate Project Manager.

COUNCILMEMBER WENINGER noted that the firm had great experience. He voiced concerns over the fact the firm had predominately focused on recruitments in the East Coast and did not have much West Coast experience.

COUNCILMEMBER DONOVAN noted that the firm had done a search in Utah.

COUNCILMEMBER HEUMANN clarified that the firms' pricing was all inclusive and added

that the warranty was better.

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO stated he was interested in the firms that would not just focus on their usual pool candidates.

COUNCILMEMBER HEUMANN believed the advertising for the position would draw a good size of applicants.

COUNCILMEMBER WENINGER saw the fact that CPS had more experience in recruiting candidates for the State of Arizona as a plus for them. He added that the guarantee should be negotiated with whichever firm is chosen.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY stated that the other firms should be contacted about having such guarantees.

COUNCILMEMBER DONOVAN questioned how many firms acted on the guarantees.

MAYOR DUNN asked if the Council had any thoughts about speaking to both firms and then narrowing down what the Council wanted in a person.

VICE-MAYOR CACCAMO suggested the Council decide what they would like do and then speak to the two firms.

In a response to a question from MAYOR DUNN, CITY ATTORNEY WADE indicated there was not a problem with the Mayor-Elect speaking to the firms.

VICE-MAYOR CACCAMO indicated he would like to interview two firms and have a point of comparison.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY felt comfortable with the other firms based on the people from the firm. He wanted staff to be able to negotiate with the firm.

COUNCILMEMBER HEUMANN suggested that a subcommittee of the Council meet, interview, and select the firm with then giving staff the direction to begin negotiations.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY suggested the Council prioritize the two firms.

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO noted he liked the idea of the subcommittee asking the firms questions about their East Coast recruitments and whether they had experience conducting recruitments in the West Coast.

COUNCILMEMBER HEUMANN stressed he wanted to know what the firms knew about the City of Chandler. He believed that the knowledge the firm has ahead of time about Chandler would show their due diligence.

COUNCILMEMBER DONOVAN stated she expected the firms to speak to the entire Council.

There was a consensus amongst the group that once a firm was selected and a contract was approved, the firm would meet with the entire Council, community leaders and staff.

MAYOR DUNN questioned if it was the group's wish to interview one or two firms.

COUNCILMEMBER HEUMANN asked if the committee could select the firm.

CITY ATTORNEY WADE stated that the committee could select the firm if it was the consensus of the entire City Council.

After roundtable discussion from the group; the Council agreed upon the following questions for the subcommittee to ask the firms:

1. What do you know about the City of Chandler?
2. What knowledge do you have of the West Coast?
3. What are the chances that the firm will get nationwide candidates?
4. Will your firm utilize stored information on past candidates?
5. Will the firm seek out a candidate who has experience in a City with the same size population of Chandler? Or will the firm seek out a candidate who has grown in their field and is looking to go up to the next level?
6. What does the firm believe Chandler's pool of candidates to be?
7. Can CPS match the same guarantee offered by Baenziger and Associates?
8. Will the warranty/guarantee be affected if services provided by the firm are cut back?
9. What type of advertising would be done for the recruitment?

MAYOR DUNN believed that the subcommittee would need to get things done in a timely manner so that the new Council could begin the process in January.

COUNCILMEMBER HEUMANN noted that some of the firms had indicated a 90-day timeframe in their proposals.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY stated that the position would possibly not be filled until May. VICE-MAYOR CACCAMO felt it would be best not to rush the process.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY asked for volunteers for the subcommittee.

After discussion, it was decided that Mayor-Elect Tibshraeny and Councilmembers Orlando, Sellers and Heumann would interview the two firms. It was agreed upon that the subcommittee choose the firm and give staff the direction to work out negotiations.

COUNCILMEMBER HEUMANN reiterated that he would like to know the level of advertising that is needed for the recruitment. He emphasized that he wanted somebody to work on the recruitment who knew about the City of Chandler.

MS. STAPLETON stated that the advertising costs would vary. She stated that the advertising for the IMCA Western Region would cost a few thousand dollars. She noted the consultant time making the phone calls or reviewing a database as well as the development and printing of the brochure. She suggested the committee ask the firms if a limited recruitment would reduce or eliminate the guarantee/warranty that was offered by the firm.

Ms. Stapleton further added that the City's Human Resources Office could handle a limited recruitment by handling the recruitment/screening of the applicants. She told the Council

that the brochure could be done in conjunction with the Communications and Public Affairs Department which would save the City money.

In a response to a question from COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO, Ms. Stapleton stated that the brochure helps advertise the City of Chandler and would help the applicant select Chandler.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY asked for staff to set-up the conference calls with the firms.

MS. STAPLETON stated she would be contacting the firms letting them know of the Council's intent.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY questioned whether the contact would be brought to the Council for approval. MS. STAPLETON indicated that the contract was under \$30,000.00. CITY ATTORNEY WADE concurred with Ms. Stapleton's statements and stated the contract would not need to be approved by the Council.

MAYOR-ELECT TIBSHRAENY stated the subcommittee members would interview the two firms (Colin Baenziger & Associates and CPS Human Resource Service), select their choice and direct staff to negotiate the contract and allow the firm to begin their needs assessment.

Adjournment: The meeting was adjourned at approximately 6:37 p.m.

ATTEST: _____
City Clerk

MAYOR

Approved: January 13, 2011

CERTIFICATION

I hereby certify that the foregoing minutes are a true and correct copy of the minutes of the special meeting of the City Council of Chandler, Arizona, held on the 9th day of December 2010. I further certify that the meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

DATED this _____ day of January 2011.

City Clerk

